

TITLE: Should the United States annex the Philippines?

AUTHOR: Clayton Henricksen, Huntley High School, Huntley, Illinois

SUMMARY: It is designed in particular to fit within the theme of United States expansion and imperialism. Prior to this lesson students will have studied, debated, and understand expansion of the United States Westward beginning with the Louisiana Purchase through Seward's Folly. The goal is for students to contextualize, analyze, and understand the decision that was made by the United States to expand overseas. In particular, the focus of the lesson will be the United States' decision to annex the Philippines after the Spanish American War. This lesson will take two fifty minute class periods to complete.

LEVEL: This particular lesson is designed for an 11th grade classroom.

CONTENT AREA: This particular lesson is designed for a United States History course.

DURATION: Recommended time is two 50 minutes classes

OBJECTIVES:

Below are the learning objectives of the lesson. By the end of the lesson students will be able to understand the larger context of the motivations of imperialism as well as understand the more specific instance between the United States and the Philippines. The following objectives below will be addressed:

Essential Question: What factors promote territorial expansion?

- Compare pro and anti-imperialistic arguments.
- Summarize the events that led up to the annexation of the Hawaiian Islands.
- Summarize the reasons behind the United States Involvement in the Spanish American War (Yellow journalism, Battleship Maine, etc.)
- Debate the positive and negatives of annexation of the Philippines and decide upon an outcome for the United States

Outcome Goals:

- Enhance reading ability through questioning
- Deeper understanding of primary sources
- Ability to collaborate with peers
- Compare and contrast various viewpoints
- Develop, justify, and create a historical argument

PROCEDURE:

Day 1

Anticipatory Set:

(5 – 10 minutes) Bell Work Question

Students will sit down as they enter the classroom and answer the question that is put up on the board. This is done to engage students in a discussion prior to the lesson beginning. Once students write down their answer to the question, follow up with a short classroom discussion with students as the lead. The question is as follows:

- When is it acceptable to control another country? Is it ever justifiable?

Classroom Activities:

(20 - 25 Minutes) – Background Information

The first classroom activity will be a brief overview on the background of imperialism, both the pro and anti-imperialist viewpoints, as well as the actions that the United States took to expand as an imperialist nation. Use **PowerPoint #1** or implement your own. Within the lecture the following will be covered:

- The definition of Imperialism
- Reasons for imperial expansion
- United States society during the late 1800's
- United States annexation of Hawaii

- The Spanish-American War
- Preview of the documents they will be analyzing

This is to provide students with background knowledge of the United States and its efforts to expand abroad.

(5-10 Minutes) – Instructional Time

The teacher should now pass out **Worksheet #1** and **Documents A-C** to students if they have not done so already. This is the opportunity for the teacher to decide if students would better work independently through **Worksheet #1** and **Documents A-C** independently or as a group. There are two options that could be made depending on the needs of the students within each classroom.

Option 1: Each student will work independently to analyze the primary sources and complete the packet on their own. Some of the sources occurred after the annexation of the Philippines but serve as the perspectives of those who opposed imperialism. Below is a short summary of each source:

Document A: Albert Beveridge: “In Support of an American Empire”

Summary: Albert Beveridge was a Senator from the state of Indiana that supported the annexation of the Philippines. Beveridge, in this piece, argues that it is the duty of the United States, ordained by God, to improve the condition of the Filipino race. Beveridge also argues that the United States would benefit due to the strategic location of the Philippines, it being in the Pacific and near to China, as well as its rich resources. Beveridge sees the annexation of the Philippines as an obligation of the American people.

Document B : William Jennings Bryan: “Imperialism”

Summary: William Jennings Bryan, famously known for his “Cross of Gold” speech and the Democratic nomination for the 1900 presidential election, was an anti-imperialist. While Bryan was at first in favor of annexing the Philippines, Bryan became known for his anti-imperial rhetoric. In this speech Bryan explains the reasoning as to why he felt imperialism was contrary to interests of the United States.

Document C : Emilio Aguinaldo: “Letter to the American People”

Summary: Aguinaldo along with the Central Filipino Committee during the American-Philippine War released this letter to air their grievances of United States occupation and the imperialist effect upon the Philippines. Aguinaldo was the leader of the rebellion against the United States after their occupation. In his letter, Aguinaldo questions the motives and treatment of the American people towards the Philippines and its people. He questions in multiple ways whether or not the United States would admit the Philippines and treat the Filipinos as American citizens.

Option 2: The teacher can decide to group students according to reading and comprehension levels. This will tier the activity as well as make it a collaborative group effort. Assigning a tier and grouping should be done prior to the lesson based on previous work and ability to collaborate. If the teacher decides to tier the lesson students should be split into groups of three. Each student will then be responsible for their individual document. The documents listed below are tiered by ability level (1 being the highest).

- Tier 1: **Document B**
- Tier 2: **Document A**
- Tier 3: **Document C**

Once the teacher decides to either tier the project or make it independent work use the time to explain the project, the outcomes, as well as the expectations. Explain to students that their task at the end is to decide upon a policy that President McKinley can adopt and then write a speech reflective of this decision, based on the documents.

(15 Minutes) – Independent Work

At the end of class each student will have time to complete the analysis of their documents. A minimum of one document should be completed for the following day. If they do not finish it in class they should complete it for homework.

Day 2

Anticipatory Set

(5 – 10 minutes) - Bell Work Question

Students will sit down as they enter the classroom and answer the question that is put up on the board. This is done to engage students in a discussion prior to the lesson beginning. Once students write down their answer to the question, follow up with a short classroom discussion with students as the lead. Prompt students to lead with answers using evidence from documents that they read the day before. The question is as follows:

- List and explain three reasons that support or are against imperialism.

Classroom Activities

(5 - 10 Minutes) – Instructional time

Quickly review the outcomes and assessment of the lesson. This will also serve as a time to get students into groups if the teacher chose **Option 2** during the previous day.

(15 - 20 Minutes) – Independent work or Group Collaboration

Option 1: Students will work independently on analyzing each source. They are to complete all three sources on their own. They should have already completed one. This will give time the teacher to check in on each student as they are working to assess their comprehension.

Option 2: Students will be placed in groups of three. Each student should have their individual document analyzed and the portion of the packet complete prior to being grouped. Once they are in groups of four each student will share their analysis of the documents with their group. The goal is to engage students in dialogue about the historical decision of the United States to annex to the Philippines.

To ensure that students are discussing and collaborating, give each student three notecards and have them each put their name on each of them. Each notecard represents a time in which the student needs to talk or share with the group. Every time each student talks they must put their notecard in the middle of their group. They must talk or share four times and place all four notecards in the middle of table by the end of the discussion. They should place at least one notecard in the middle of the group for when they share their document.

(15 -20 Minutes) – Independent Work

Regardless if the teacher chose **Option1** or **Option 2** students will have time to complete the final assessment. After either analyzing the documents independently or having a discussion with a group about the differing perspectives students will be able to make a final decision of whether or not the United States should annex the Philippines. The assessment is a writing piece from the perspective of President William McKinley. The directions are as follows:

Directions: After reviewing your letters and firsthand accounts, it is your time to decide as the President!

- **What will you do with the Philippines?**

In order to address the nation write a speech from the point of view of the President. This speech must clearly layout your plan of action. Did you decide to annex the Philippines or not?

Requirements of this speech:

- You must address which plan of action you took.
- You must give at least three reasons why you decided on the plan of action and why.
- You must summarize your decision and what your plan for the Philippines and America is in the future.
- This should be done in no less than 6-8 sentences. Convince the world this is the right choice!

Collect **Worksheet #1** when students are done with the summative portion of the lesson.

Summative - Class Vote

There are also multiple options teachers can take to increase the role playing aspect of the lesson.

Option #1: Take a quick poll of the class of whether or not the United States should annex the Philippines!

Option #2: In addition teachers may also ask students to share their speech and can set the classroom with the podium at the front of the classroom. Teachers may also want to have students listening to the speech, ask questions once they are done as another means of student participation.

Option #3: Have each student's in their group of three (if teacher has decided to go that route) share their speeches with one another. Have each group decide upon which speech was the best as well as which course of action that group would like to take. Once completed, compare and contrast justifications between the different groups in class.

Follow Up

Teachers may choose to have students compare and contrast their speeches with a primary source in which President McKinley explains his thought process and justification for annexing the Philippines. It is **Document D** but is an optional extension to the lesson.

Assessment

Students will turn in their document analysis packet as well as their speeches by the end of the second day. This will be graded on accuracy as well as reasoning. This will not be the first time students will be assessed in class with these types of documents.

- Assessment 1 – Document Analysis
 - Can students correctly analyze a primary source?
 - Focus on detail, main idea, and viewpoint & purpose
- Assessment 2 – President McKinley Speech
 - Can the students decide and then correctly justify a historical decision using evidence?
 - Focus on detail and viewpoint & purpose

MATERIALS/REFERENCES:

"Albert J. Beveridge, "In Support of an American Empire"" ALBERT J. BEVERIDGE, "In Support of an American Empire" Web.

Summary: Albert Beveridge was a Senator from the state of Indiana that supported the annexation of the Philippines. Beveridge, in this piece, argues that it is the duty of the United States, ordained by God, to improve the condition of the Filipino race. Beveridge also argues that the United States would benefit due to the strategic location of the Philippines, it being in the Pacific and near to China, as well as its rich resources. Beveridge sees the annexation of the Philippines as an obligation of the American people.

Emilio Aguinaldo, Central Filipino Committee, LETTER TO THE AMERICAN PEOPLE, (1899).

Summary: Aguinaldo along with the Central Filipino Committee during the American-Philippine War released this letter to air their grievances of United States occupation and the imperialist effect upon the Philippines. Aguinaldo was the leader of the rebellion against the United States after their occupation. In his letter, Aguinaldo questions the motives and treatment of the American people towards the Philippines and its people. He questions in multiple ways whether or not the United States would admit the Philippines and treat the Filipinos as American citizens.

General James Rusling, "Interview with President William McKinley," The Christian Advocate 22 January 1903, 17.

Summary: In an interview five years after the annexation of the Philippines, President McKinley shares his revelations and justification for annexing the Philippines. He admits that he did not know what he was going to do and that he had little help in deciding. McKinley admits to divine intervention and lays out his four major justifications as to why he annexed the Philippines. The next day, according to him, he emphatically proclaims that the Philippines shall be put on the map of America.

William Jennings Bryan, "Imperialism," recorded in 1901; from Michigan State University, Earliest Voices: A Gallery from the Vincent Voice Library, http://www.historicalvoices.org/earliest_voices/bryan.html.

Summary: William Jennings Bryan, famously known for his "Cross of Gold" speech and the Democratic nomination for the 1900 presidential election, was an anti-imperialist. While Bryan was at first in favor of annexing the Philippines, Bryan became known for his anti-imperial rhetoric. In this speech Bryan explains the reasoning as to why he felt imperialism was contrary to interests of the United States.

APPENDICES:

PowerPoint #1

Slide 1

1890s-1900s American Territorial Expansion - The Spanish American War and the Annexation of the Philippines

Bell Work: Should one country ever control another country? Why or why not?

- Are there instances in history that you can think of?
- *Fun Fact:* The U.S. Census of 1890 famously declared the American frontier to be closed. A decade later, the United States appeared well on the way to establishing new frontiers and perhaps a new imperial political system.

Slide 2

What is Imperialism?

Imperialism: the policy in which stronger nations extend their economic, political, or military control over weaker territories

What motivations do countries have to expand overseas?

1. Military Objectives
 - Example: To secure strategic military bases outside the U.S.
2. Economic Objectives
 - Example: To expand to new markets and gain more resources
3. Cultural objectives
 - Example: To 'Christianize' and 'civilize' other nations

Slide 3

What was American Society like in the 1890's?

- Westward Expansion
- The growing number of immigrants
- The Competition of Races

Slide 4

What led to the Spanish – American War in 1898?

- American interest in Cuba
 - Strategic location in Caribbean Sea
 - 90 miles off the coast of Florida
 - Security concerns if passed from Spain to stronger hand
- Spanish Rule
 - Denied Cubans civil liberties and political rights, levied heavy taxes, restricted foreign trade and ruthlessly suppressed several rebellions
 - Speaks to the hear of Americans!

Slide 5

What is an example of American Imperial expansion?

Hawaii

- American missionaries arrived in the 1820s
- 1860s: Americans are the majority
- 1870s: Americans controlled most of the land and trade
 - Resource: Sugar Plantations are important
- 1876: the United States demanded Pearl Harbor
 - Strategic location in Pacific
- 1893 supporters of annexation overthrew the Hawaiian monarchy of Queen Liliokalani
 - United States annexed Hawaii in 1898.



HAWAIIAN ISLANDS

Slide 6

What were the causes of the Spanish – American War in 1898?

- Humanitarianism
 - Americans sympathized with the desire of the Cuban people to be independent. America was outraged when Cuban civilians were put into concentration camps to prevent them from aiding the rebellion. (200,000 men, women and children died of starvation)
- Economic Interests
 - American trade and investors had much to lose if Cuba fell
- "Yellow" Journalism
 - Joseph Pulitzer and William Randolph Hearst used sensational news to increase newspaper circulation
- Sinking of the USS Maine
 - Americans chose to believe Spain was behind the sinking of the ship which resulted in the loss of 260 lives

Slide 7

What should the United States do with the Philippines?

- Now that you know about the Imperialism, American Society, and the Spanish-American you must decide what to do!
 - Either annex the Philippines and build an empire or not!
- Pretend that you are President McKinley:
 - Does the United States have the right to annex the Philippines?
 - Are they betraying their ideas of freedom and equality if they do annex another country?
 - What are the positive and negative outcomes of a possible annexation of the Philippines?

"When next I realized that the Philippines had dropped into our laps, I confess I did not know what to do with them." - President McKinley

- You get to decide!

Slide 8

What factors promote territorial expansion?

The Philippines after the Spanish-American War

- With "Remember the Maine!" as their battle cry, American forces swept quickly and easily to victory. In the Pacific, Commodore George Dewey led an American naval force to destroy the Spanish fleet at Manila, the capital of the Philippines, and an American army took possession of the city. In the Caribbean, American naval units destroyed the Spanish fleet at Santiago, Cuba. Meanwhile, American forces captured this city after a battle famed for the dash up San Juan Hill by Theodore Roosevelt and his Rough Riders

Fun fact: The "splendid little war" saw more American soldiers killed by tropical diseases than Spanish guns.

Slide 9

Preview of Sources

Document A: Albert Beveridge

Document B: William Jennings Bryan

Document C: Emilio Aguinaldo

American Imperialism – The Question of the Philippines

Background: Now that the United States has defeated the Spanish in the Spanish-American War, what should the United States do with the Philippines?

Pretend that you are President McKinley. The United States has recently stepped into the realms of international expansion as seen with the annexation of Hawaii. Many citizens do not want the United States to stop at Hawaii however. Buoyed by the success of continental expansion and the belief in 'Manifest Destiny' people are calling for the United States to expand and civilize the world. The Spanish were recently no match for the Americans and the Philippines were a colonial possession of the Spanish that is now up for grabs. The question then becomes, what should be done about the Philippines?

Things that President McKinley must think about leading up to the decision:

- Does the United States have the right to annex the Philippines?
- Are they betraying their ideas of freedom and equality if they do annex another country?
- What are the positive and negative outcomes of a possible annexation of the Philippines?

This is what he first thought when the annexation of the Philippines first became a possibility:

"When next I realized that the Philippines had dropped into our laps, I confess I did not know what to do with them."

- Source: General James Rusling, "Interview with President William McKinley," *The Christian Advocate* 22 January 1903, 17.

Part I: Viewpoints on the Annexation of the Philippines

Directions: As President McKinley, in order to understand multiple viewpoints, read firsthand accounts of varying opinions regarding the annexation of the Philippines after the Spanish American War. These viewpoints will both be positive and negative.

Document A: Senator Albert Beveridge: In Support of American Empire

What is the viewpoint of this author? Pro-Imperialism or Anti-Imperialism
Below cite one piece of evidence that justifies the viewpoint of the author:

List three reasons either why the United States should annex the Philippines or why they should not, according to this author.

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Using the quote above summarize the author's main idea of the text (5-6 sentences)

After reading this text, if you were the President, are you convinced that this is the correct course of action for the United States? Why or why not?

Document B: William Jennings Bryan: "Imperialism"

What is the viewpoint of this author? Pro-Imperialism or Anti-Imperialism

Below cite one piece of evidence that justifies the viewpoint of the author:

List three reasons either why the United States should annex the Philippines or why they should not, according to this author.

- 1.

- 2.

- 3.

Using the quote above summarize the author's main idea of the text (5-6 sentences)

After reading this text, if you were the President, are you convinced that this is the correct course of action for the United States? Why or why not?

Document C: Emilio Aguinaldo: "Letter to the American People"

What is the viewpoint of this author? Pro-Imperialism or Anti-Imperialism

Below cite one piece of evidence that justifies the viewpoint of the author:

List three reasons either why the United States should annex the Philippines or why they should not, according to this author.

- 1.
- 2.
- 3.

Using the quote above summarize the author's main idea of the text (5-6 sentences)

Document A: Albert J. Beveridge, "In Support of an American Empire"

"MR. PRESIDENT, the times call for candor. The Philippines are ours forever, "territory belonging to the United States," as the Constitution calls them. And just beyond the Philippines are China's illimitable markets. We will not retreat from either. We will not repudiate our duty in the archipelago. We will not abandon our opportunity in the Orient. We will not renounce our part in the mission of our race, trustee, under God, of the civilization of the world. And we will move forward to our work, not howling out regrets like slaves whipped to their burdens but with gratitude for a task worthy of our strength and thanksgiving to Almighty God that He has marked us as His chosen people, henceforth to lead in the regeneration of the world.

This island empire is the last land left in all the oceans. If it should prove a mistake to abandon it, the blunder once made would be irretrievable. If it proves a mistake to hold it, the error can be corrected when we will. Every other progressive nation stands ready to relieve us.

But to hold it will be no mistake. Our largest trade henceforth must be with Asia. The Pacific is our ocean. More and more Europe will manufacture the most it needs, secure from its colonies the most it consumes. Where shall we turn for consumers of our surplus? Geography answers the question. China is our natural customer. She is nearer to us than to England, Germany, or Russia, the commercial powers of the present and the future. They have moved nearer to China by securing permanent bases on her borders. The Philippines give us a base at the door of all the East.

Lines of navigation from our ports to the Orient and Australia, from the Isthmian Canal to Asia, from all Oriental ports to Australia converge at and separate from the Philippines. They are a self-supporting, dividend-paying fleet, permanently anchored at a spot selected by the strategy of Providence, commanding the Pacific. And the Pacific is the ocean of the commerce of the future. Most future wars will be conflicts for commerce. The power that rules the Pacific, therefore, is the power that rules the world. And, with the Philippines, that power is and will forever be the American Republic. . . .

But if they did not command China, India, the Orient, the whole Pacific for purposes of offense, defense, and trade, the Philippines are so valuable in themselves that we should hold them. I have cruised more than 2,000 miles through the archipelago, every moment a surprise at its loveliness and wealth. I have ridden hundreds of miles on the islands, every foot of the way a revelation of vegetable and mineral riches. . . .

Here, then, senators, is the situation. Two years ago there was no land in all the world which we could occupy for any purpose. Our commerce was daily turning toward the Orient, and geography and trade developments made necessary our commercial empire over the Pacific. And in that ocean we had no commercial, naval, or military base. Today, we have one of the three great ocean possessions of the globe, located at the most commanding commercial, naval, and military points in the Eastern seas, within hail of India, shoulder to shoulder with China, richer in its own resources than any equal body of land on the entire globe, and peopled by a race which civilization demands shall be improved. Shall we abandon it?"

Document B: William Jennings Bryan, "Imperialism"

Imperialism is the policy of an empire. And an empire is a nation composed of different races, living under varying forms of government. A republic cannot be an empire, for a republic rests upon the theory that governments derive their powers from the consent of the governed and colonialism violates this theory. We do not want the Filipinos for citizens. They cannot, without danger to us, share in the government of our nation and moreover, we cannot afford to add another race question to the race questions which we already have. Neither can we hold the Filipinos as subjects even if we could benefit them by doing... Our experiment in colonialism has been unfortunate. Instead of profit, it has brought loss. Instead of strength, it has brought weakness. Instead of glory, it has brought humiliation.

Document C: Emilio Aguinaldo, "Letter to the American People"

June 1900.

God Almighty knows how unjust is the war which the Imperial arms have provoked and are maintaining against our unfortunate country! If the honest American patriots could understand the sad truth of this declaration, we are sure they would, without the least delay, stop this unspeakable horror.

When we protested against this iniquitous ingratitude, then the guns of the United States were turned upon us; we were denounced as traitors and rebels; you destroyed the homes to which you had been welcomed as honored guests, killing thousands of those who had been your allies, mutilating our old men, our women and our children, and watering with blood and strewing with ruins the beautiful soil of our Fatherland.

... the Spanish government, whose despotic cruelty American Imperialism now imitates, and in some respects surpasses, denied to us many of the liberties which you were already enjoying when, under pretext of oppression, you revolted against British domination.

Why do the Imperialists wish to subjugate us? What do they intend to do with us? Do they expect us to surrender -- to yield our inalienable rights, our homes, our properties, our lives, our future destinies, to the absolute control of the United States? What would you do with our nine millions of people? Would you permit us to take part in your elections? Would you concede to us the privilege of sending Senators and Representatives to your Congress? Would you allow us to erect one or more federal states? Or, would you tax us without representation? Would you change your tariff laws so as to admit our products free of duty and in competition with the products of our own soil?

Document D: President McKinley, "Decision on the Philippines"

When next I realized that the Philippines had dropped into our laps, I confess I did not know what to do with them. I sought counsel from all sides-Democrats as well as Republicans-but got little help. I thought first we would take only Manila; then Luzon; then other islands, perhaps, also.

I walked the floor of the White House night after night until midnight; and I am not ashamed to tell you, gentlemen, that I went down on my knees and prayed to Almighty God for light and guidance more than one night. And one night late it came to me this way-I don't know how it was, but it came:

- (1) That we could not give them back to Spain-that would be cowardly and dishonorable;
- (2) That we could not turn them over to France or Germany, our commercial rivals in the Orient-that would be bad business and discreditable;
- (3) That we could not leave them to themselves-they were unfit for self-government, and they would soon have anarchy and misrule worse than Spain's was; and
- (4) That there was nothing left for us to do but to take them all, and to educate the Filipinos, and uplift and civilize and Christianize them and by God's grace do the very best we could by them, as our fellow men for whom Christ also died.

And then I went to bed and went to sleep, and slept soundly, and the next morning I sent for the chief engineer of the War Department (our map-maker), and I told him to put the Philippines on the map of the United States (pointing to a large map on the wall of his office), and there they are and there they will stay while I am President!